Discrepancy on Degree of Grammaticalization of Japanese and Korean Negative Sensitive Items: A Corpus-Based Study

(Category: Functional/ Grammaticalization)

Introduction
This work considers behavior observed in -sika (only), which is one of the negative sensitive items (NSI) in Japanese and its Korean counterpart, -pakkey. Specifically, our main focus is on degree of grammaticalization discrepancy between -sika and -pakkey. One of our empirical findings with respect to this discrepancy is that unlike -sika, -pakkey can co-occur with other NSIs such as wh+to only when the -pakkey phrase is marked with primary postpositions, not with secondary postpositions. This finding provides us several interesting implications: [1] contrary to what is widely observed in the literature (See Martin (1975), Nam (1994), A-H.-O. Kim (2001), Sells (2001), Lee (2002), inter alia), -sika is not exactly the same as -pakkey. Also, [2] the discrepancy gives us implications as followed: degree of grammaticalization of -sika is higher than one of -pakkey.

Data and Observation
This paper has investigated use frequency between sika and pakkey with six different types of books such as (i) English-Japanese vs. English-Korean translation novels based on the same English titled edition, (ii) Japanese vs. Japanese-Korean translation novels based on the same Japanese titled edition, (iii) Korean vs. Korean-Japanese translation short story based on the same Korean titled edition. According to Bybee (2001) (2003), use frequency affects the degree of grammaticalization, which is called ‘Frequency Effects’. Specifically, ‘Frequency Effects’ refers that an item with higher frequency has undergone more advanced grammaticalization. We obtain the interesting results as shown in (Table 1).

(Table 1) a. English-Japanese vs. English-Korean translation novels
   (Based on Harry Porter: the Sorcerer’s Stone)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>sika (English-Japanese translation)</th>
<th>pakkey (English-Korean translation)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>54 times</td>
<td>22 times</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

   (Based on noruwei no mori ‘Norwegian wood’)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>sika (Japanese)</th>
<th>pakkey (Japanese-Korean translation)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>91 times</td>
<td>68 times</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

c. Korean vs. Korean-Japanese translation short story (Based on ppong)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>sika (Korean-Japanese translation)</th>
<th>pakkey (Korean)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3 times</td>
<td>2 times</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In (Table 1a, b), we can see that -sika greatly outnumbers -pakkey. This means that Japanese -sika is more widely used than Korean -pakkey in those books. Specifically, around 40% of -pakkey in (Table 1a) and about 35% of -pakkey in (Table 1b) do not correspond to -sika. Here, a question arises: if so, what items in Korean correspond to -sika in those translated books? It is found that -man or -ppwun ‘only’ in Korean are mainly translated as a counterpart of -sika instead of -pakkey. Consider the following examples.

(1) a. watasi-no sun-de iru ryou-nante tenjou-to mado-sika nai-mono.

I-GEN live-ASP dormitory-though roof-and window-SIKA NEG-MODAL
‘The dormitory where I live has only a roof and window.’ (noruwe ni mori)
b. ce-ka sal-ko issun kiswuksa-nun chencang-kwa changmwun ppwun-in kelyo.

I-GEN live-ASP dormitory-TOP roof-and window-PPWUN-MODAL (noruweyi-uy swup)

It has been said that -man or -ppwun in Korean are semantically quite similar to -pakkey (See A.H-O Kim (1997), Sells (2001), inter alia). However, many studies such as Kuno and Whitman (2004) argue that -pakkey is not exactly the same as -man or -ppwun. Interestingly, there also exist these Korean expressions in Japanese such as -dake or -bakari ‘only’. Similarly, it is said that -dake or -bakari are not exactly the same as -sika, although they are semantically similar to -sika (See Kuno (1999) for more details). It seems that unlike Japanese speakers, Korean speakers still prefer to use -man or -ppwun instead of -pakkey. Based on this fact, we can assume that -pakkey has not completely grammaticalized and grammaticalization of -pakkey has been still ongoing.

**Diachronic Implications**

This line of reasoning can be supported by the fact that grammaticalization processes of -sika into NSI have been periodically earlier than ones of pakkey. Consider (2) and (3).

(2)  
&sika: mid 18th C 19th C mid 20th C (1930’s)  
1st stage of postposition (NSI) > 2nd stage (NSI) > 3rd stage (NSI)  
sika  
> sika  
> sika  
(3)  
pakkey: mid 15th C - end of 19th C early-mid 20th C still ongoing  
(Noun > Adverb) > 1st stage of postposition (NSI) > 2nd stage (NSI) > 3rd stage (NSI)  
(pakkey) > paskey > paskey > pakkey  
As shown in (2) and (3), -sika as an NSI at first stage appeared in the literature in the middle of 18th century, whereas -pakkey appeared in the end of 19th century. In addition, -sika as an NSI at third stage appeared in the early-mid 20th century, while -pakkey appeared during mid 20th C to present day. It may be plausible to argue that -pakkey has been not completely grammaticalized in contrast with -sika. In fact, -pakkey in the third stage does not seem to be completely grammaticalized like -sika as shown in (4).

(4)  
a. konkai-wa nongyou ni kansite-sika (nani-mo) genkyuusi-masen.  
this time-TOP agriculture-with regard-to SIKA wh-mo mention-NEG  
‘They will mention only with regard to agriculture this time.’

b.*ipen-ey-nun nongep-ey kwanhayse-pakkey (amwukes-to) enkup ha-ci anh-kess-supni-ta.  
this time-TOP agriculture-with regard to PAKKEY wh-to mention-COMP NEG-FUT-DECL

(5)  
a. kore-va jiko genin-o chanto kaimeisi-te kara-sika (nani-mo) deki-nai.  
this-TOP accidents reason-ACC surely figure out-and then SIKA wh-mo can-NEG  
‘We can do it only after we surely figured it out.’

b.*ikes-un sako wenil ul ceytaylo haymyeyng ha-ko nase-pakkey (amwukes-to) hal swu ep-ta.  
this-TOP accidents reason-ACC surely figure out-and then PAKKEY wh-to can-NEG

(cf)  
Wuli-nun ku pwn-eykey nolae-lo-pakkey (amwokes-to) kapul swu ep-ta.  
we-TOP the person-to song-with PAKKEY wh-to pay back NEG-DECL

‘We can pay him back only with songs.’

As seen in (4a) and (5a), -sika can be attached to secondary postpositions such as -ni kansite ‘with regard to’ as in (4a) or -te kara ‘and then’ as in (5a). Moreover, it can co-occur with wh-mo. In contrast, Korean counterparts of these sentences are unacceptable as in (4b) and (5b). Interestingly enough, when -pakkey is attached to primary postpositions such as -lo ‘with’, -pPUTE ‘from’, -kkaci ‘until’, it can co-occur with wh-to as illustrated in (cf). This fact sheds light on the idea that grammaticalization of -pakkey, which has been ongoing from third stage unlike -sika.